

MINUTES OF COUNCIL SPECIAL MEETING

6 SEPTEMBER 2022

Held in the Council Chambers, Administration Building
1 Nicholas Street, Ipswich

The meeting commenced at 3.00 pm

ATTENDANCE AT COMMENCEMENT

Mayor Teresa Harding (Chairperson); Deputy Mayor Jacob Madsen (via audio-link), Councillors Sheila Ireland (via audio-link), Paul Tully, Marnie Doyle, Andrew Fechner, Kate Kunzelmann, Russell Milligan and Nicole Jonic (via audio-link)

MEETING ATTENDANCE VIA AUDIO-LINK

Moved by Mayor Teresa Harding:
Seconded by Councillor Kate Kunzelmann:

That in accordance with section 254K of the *Local Government Regulation 2012* and 8.6.2 of Council's Meeting Procedures Policy (Attendance at committee meetings), Councillors Sheila Ireland, Jacob Madsen and Nicole Jonic be permitted to participate in the meeting via audio-link.

AFFIRMATIVE

Councillors:

Harding

Tully

Doyle

Fechner

Kunzelmann

Milligan

NEGATIVE

Councillors:

Nil

The motion was put and carried.

WELCOME TO COUNTRY OR ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF COUNTRY

Councillor Kate Kunzelmann

OPENING PRAYER

Councillor Paul Tully

APOLOGIES AND LEAVE OF ABSENCE

Nil

5. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST IN MATTERS ON THE AGENDA

In accordance with section 150EQ of the *Local Government Act 2009*, Councillor Nicole Jonic informed the meeting that she has a declarable conflict of interest in Item 6.1 titled Development Application – 6610/2022/MCU – Recommendation – Parmac Property Investments Pty Ltd – Fast Food Premises (KFC) at Goodna.

The nature of the interest is that Councillor Jonic, along with other members of her family, hold property in Goodna and have been approached by the applicant, Parmac Property Investments Pty Ltd, in the past relating to these holdings.

Councillor Nicole Jonic advised that she will voluntarily leave the meeting room (including any area set aside for the public) while this matter is being discussed and voted on.

6. OFFICER'S REPORT

At 3.04 pm Councillor Nicole Jonic left the meeting room.

**6.1
DEVELOPMENT
APPLICATION -
6610/2022/MCU -
RECOMMENDATION -
PARMAC PROPERTY
INVESTMENTS PTY
LTD - FAST FOOD
PREMISES (KFC) AT
GOODNA
FORESHADOWED
MOTION**

Moved by Mayor Teresa Harding:

Seconded by Councillor Andrew Fechner:

That Council resolve to approve development application no. 6610/2022/MCU being a Material Change of Use – Business Use (Fast Food Premises), subject to conditions as contained in Attachment 1 of this report.

Councillor Paul Tully foreshadowed that he would move an alternate motion in the event that Mayor Harding's motion was lost.

- A. That application number 6610/2022 MCU in relation to the property situated at 16 Queen Street Goodna, received on 8 July 2022 from Parmac Property Investments Pty Ltd for a Material Change of Use – Business Use (Fast Food Premises), be refused for the following reasons:

1. History of Goodna

Goodna was first recorded as a name by Surveyor James Warner in the 1840s and was officially established in 1856 when it was still part of New South Wales and still retains some of its unique local character, 24km west of the Brisbane CBD and 16km to the east of the Ipswich CBD. Refusal of this development is the only way this dwelling

and its environs can be protected in situ for future generations.

2. History of the site

The property at 16 Queen Street Goodna was identified in the Ipswich City Council 1992 Heritage Study by the University of Queensland as of key heritage significance in the suburb.

The importance of the property included the age of the dwelling – c.1906 – combined with its historical social significance within the local area.

The dwelling at 16 Queen Street Goodna was home, for some four decades until the 1940s, for the well-known Queensland family of John and Mary Carroll. John and Mary had opened and taught at a day school at Redbank Plains from 1874 to 1909. They had seven sons and two daughters including their second son Edward John Carroll who formed the famous national cinematic chain of *Birch Carroll & Coyle* with E.J. Carroll, introducing “talkie” movies to Ipswich, Toowoomba and other parts of Queensland and Australia.

The Carroll family home at this location was a major social hub in southeast Queensland during the early decades of the 20th century with entertainers from the United Kingdom and the United States in attendance over the years.

One such entertainer was renowned Scottish singer Sir Harry Lauder who attended the Carroll family home in July 1925 which was reported in *The Brisbane Courier* of 27 July 1925.

3. Official recognition of the site

The importance of the building and location is officially recognised:

- (a) In the Ipswich Planning Scheme as a pre-1946 dwelling recognised in the scheme as Schedule 3 listing;
- (b) By virtue of the heritage plaque proposed by the Ipswich City Council Planning and Development Department and erected by the Council in 2012, with the consent of the then owner, just inside the front boundary of the property which reads:

“This was one the home of Mary Carroll who purchased the land in 1906. Mary and her husband John Carroll were well known and respected within the community. They opened and taught at a day school at Redbank Plains from 1874 to 1909 where Mary was assistant head teacher and John was the head teacher.

Mary and John had 9 children, seven sons and two daughters. Edward John Carroll and Daniel Joseph Carroll were theatrical and cinema managers and they screened silent films in Ipswich and Brisbane in the early 20th century. Edward joined with G.H. Birch to form Messrs Birch and Carroll which later became Birch, Carroll and Coyle. It was this house that Mrs Carroll entertained guests of her sons who come from overseas. Harry Lauder, the Scottish coal miner with a ‘glorious voice’ was one such guest.

*An initiative of Ipswich City Council
(marker number 101”;*

- (c) by the widespread recognition of the historical importance of the property by the Ipswich City Council and the community with its inclusion in the Council publication “Goodna Then and Now” in 2003 which identifies the property at 16 Queen Street Goodna relating to its age, history and social importance.

4. Proposed development of the site

The proposed removal of the dwelling to make way for a gaudy Kentucky Fried Chicken store operating 24 hours a day, 7 days a week would make a mockery of the Ipswich Planning Scheme by placing undue emphasis on the zoning of the property (Major Centres Zone) compared with its major historical significance, when both can be simultaneously recognised and addressed with the retention of the existing dwelling.

Moving the home to Rosewood some 35km away is not an adequate alternative nor an appropriate recognition of the historical and existing development of this site within the broader Goodna area during the past 166 years.

There is strong community opposition to the development – despite the fact this is code assessable and not advertised – in the printed and online newspapers in the local area, when the current application became known to

the community, including for example in *Ipswich News Today* on 21 July 2022:

“Locals reject heritage house move bid

Goodna residents say they don’t need another KFC – especially one that would come at the expense of a historic home.

Timothy Carmichael, who lives two houses down from the property, wrote on social media the house was “one of the most beautiful homes in the street”.

Simon Ingram wrote it was “ridiculous, damaging to our heritage and completely unnecessary.”

Another resident, Andrew Mirfin, said it make a joke of protecting heritage listed houses.

“To me that includes the site it was originally built on. By moving the house it has no heritage significance anymore.”

The underlying planning zoning (Major Centres Zone) does not preclude the adaptive reuse of the building for a wide variety of commercial and/or community uses which would provide proper recognition of the important heritage value of the property in situ, enabling both the heritage value and the zoning of the property to be equally recognised, without sterilising appropriate use of the site for commercial or community purposes.

The dwelling is the only remaining property of its era from the early 1900s in Queen Street Goodna (the main street) from the Ipswich Motorway, south to Alice Street Goodna – a distance of almost 600 metres – creating the last opportunity for this only surviving dwelling of its vintage and social significance and the associated site to continue to be recognised and protected as part of the rich heritage of Goodna. Having a plaque installed and/or other online recognition of the site, if the building were to be removed and a fast-food premises established, would be a travesty of proper recognition of local history for the people of Goodna and the City of Ipswich.

5. Traffic and Amenity

At 16 Queen Street Goodna, the external carriageway is a relatively narrow 2-lane road with a narrow verge on each

side. This does not permit a road widening to allow for a deceleration lane or left turn lane into or out of the property heading south from the Ipswich Motorway or a separate turning lane into the property heading north, coming from the direction of Redbank Plains.

Queen Street Goodna is one of the busiest suburban roads in the City of Ipswich (excluding main roads) with a traffic count of 18,181 vehicle movements a day, according to the latest official traffic survey by Ipswich City Council in 2021.

Notwithstanding the Applicant's traffic proposal, the operation of KFC's Redbank and Redbank Plains stores located within major shopping centres demonstrates an excessive amount of vehicular traffic causing traffic bank-ups on internal roads and interfering with cars attempting to enter and/or leave both sites. The proposed store at Goodna, fronting Queen Street would bring identical problems onto the main street and would be certain to create traffic chaos in Queen Street given the way in which the other local KFC stores operate in practice many hours each day.

Once the queuing facility within the proposed KFC site is full, traffic on Queen Street would come to a complete standstill as there is no passing lane in either direction and no physical way to provide one. If northbound traffic were to be banned from entering the site, vehicles would have to travel north to the existing heavily congested Goodna Roundabout at the corner of Queen and Church Streets, with 6 separate traffic legs associated with that roundabout. This would put additional strain on the roundabout exacerbating existing safety issues in relation to the roundabout as well as the nearby pedestrian crossing/school crossing at 9 Queen Street Goodna which services St Francis Xavier Catholic School at Church Street Goodna.

- B. That the foregoing reasons constitute Council's reasons for its decision pursuant to section 254H of the *Local Government Regulation 2012*.

AFFIRMATIVE

Councillors:

Harding

Fechner

Kunzelmann

Milligan

NEGATIVE

Councillors:

Madsen

Ireland

Tully

Doyle (Abstain)

All Councillors except Councillor Nicole Jonic were present when the vote was taken.

The Mayor used her casting vote for the original motion and the original motion was carried.

MEETING CLOSED

The meeting closed at 4.04 pm.